

Policy 'trail' from the University of Dhaka to public universities: Construction of 'education' as a discipline in Bangladesh

Ariful Haq Kabir¹

Abstract

The concept of 'policy trail' is often used to understand how certain policy characteristics in terms of ideas, people, and resources have been travelled over time. Drawing on the idea of 'policy trail', this paper attempts to understand how 'education' as an area of study was established at the university of Dhaka in 1959, and after 50 years of its establishment, how such an idea of 'education' as a distinct discipline has been travelled into other public universities in Bangladesh. To present the narratives of the "policy trail" in creating "education" as a distinct discipline in Bangladesh, this article, based on qualitative research techniques, uses a qualitative content analysis in documents. This paper aims to advance knowledge of how policy is transferred from the Global North to the Global South and how such policy genres are transferred through various public institutions within a nation-state.

Keywords: Policy trail, policy travel, education as a discipline, University of Dhaka, Bangladesh

Corresponding email: akabir@du.ac.bd

Received : 02 May 2022

Reviewed: 01 February 2023

Suggested Citation: Kabir, A. H. (2022). Policy 'trail' from the University of Dhaka to public universities: Construction of 'education' as a discipline in Bangladesh. *Teacher's World: Journal of Education and Research*, 48 (1).

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.3329/twjer.v48i1.67537>



Introduction

Education as a discipline has been shaped and reconstructed by both theoretical paradigms and historical events. From the ancient period to the contemporary world, it is evident that these two elements have been influencing fundamental threshold principles of education, including what to be learnt and what not to be learnt [content and curriculum], and how learning would be taught [pedagogy] and assessed [assessment systems]. The governments, for instance, inclined with conservative ideological perspectives, often see a teacher-centred teaching approach as a key teaching method to distil a particular kind of knowledge into students (Broadfoot, 2011).

Whatever the knowledge, teaching methods, and assessment systems have been promoted by conservative and progressive governments in a particular country context, the ideas about education have also been a part of global policy networks. Pressure to establish an education system based on the neoliberal policy ideology in developing countries was particularly brought

¹ Institute of Education and Research, University of Dhaka

on by “semantics globalization”, and politics and economics (Steiner-Khamsi, 2006). In so doing, international agencies, e.g. the World Bank, OECD, UNESCO, UNICEF, IMF, WTO, and USAID, are being involved in education policy transformation from the global north to the global south (Torres, 2009). Apart from the education transformation at the transnational level, policy ideas have also been transformed at the state, institutional and individual levels (Ozga, 2011). In particular, a new policy community has emerged within the nation-state, making ties and forming policy networks to reframe the policy in local settings (Ball, 2008).

This paper is about how ‘education’ as a distinctive discipline has emerged in Bangladesh. In so doing, the idea of a ‘policy trail’ is used by policy networks in Bangladesh to understand how to shape and reconstruct threshold principles of education in public universities. The idea of policy trailing refers to understanding how particular policy ideas are reproduced and reconstructed by policy networks rather than state or transnational levels policymakers (Halford and McKenzie, 2013). By investigating different policy documents, including different universities’ education curriculums, laws, and other relevant documents, this paper explores how the Institute of Education and Research (IER) at the University of Dhaka (DU) emerged through the internationalisation of higher education project and how IER at DU has been going through different phases to develop education as a distinctive discipline in the context of Bangladesh, and the ideas about education have been shaped and reconstructed in other public universities based on what IER at DU conceives education as a distinctive discipline.

After this brief introduction, this paper attempts to understand the idea of a ‘policy trail’ and its theoretical implication in this paper. Afterwards, it looks at the historical development of teacher education in Bangladesh and then explores how IER at DU was established through the internationalisation of higher education projects. It then exemplifies how IER at DU contributes to the development of five fundamental threshold principles of education, including aims and objectives, governance, curriculums, pedagogy, and assessment of education as a distinctive discipline, and how these threshold principles have been transformed in other public universities through the idea of policy trailing.

Understanding the idea of ‘policy trail’

Understanding how specific policy characteristics, in terms of ideas, people, and both ideational and material resources, have travelled through time, “either intentionally or accidentally, as well as its physicality and imaginary potentials,” is the idea of “policy trail” (Milana, 2015, p. 517) developed by Holford for the LLLight project in Europe (Holford and McKenzie, 2013). Policy-making processes have been shaped by shifting the state power from government to governance, where various policy networks are participating in the policy-making process (Cort, 2014; Kabir, 2021). Therefore, it is significant to look at how policy space has become widened and how power has been distributed across policy networks (Cort, 2014). The idea of a policy trail, rather than looking at policy as a top-down, bottom-up, or horizontal process, emphasises

how policy is recontextualised and reproduced through the relationship between policy actors and sites. Most importantly, policy trail is being occurred from out-of-state influence and can be taken at the point of departure at any stage and level and any point by not only those who are involved in the policy networks but also a range of practitioners and researchers involved in the institutions (Cort, 2014). Moreover, policy trailing could also be unfolded from public to public, public to private, and vice-versa.

Using the idea of policy trail, this paper aims to understand how whole parts or some parts of the threshold principles in the discipline of education have been reconstructed and recontextualised from the IER at DU into other public universities in Bangladesh. For the purpose of this analysis, I look at the historical development of teacher education in Bangladesh, what was being said about threshold principles in the discipline of education developed by the IER at the DU, and how some of the ideas of these threshold principles in education were pulled together into some other public universities.

Historical development of teacher education in Bangladesh

Despite teaching being considered a noble profession in ancient India – both in Hindu and Buddhist periods – and in Muslim periods, teacher education as a field of study was not taught in higher education institutions then. During the Buddhist period, higher education institutions were developed through many monasteries/viharas. Students learned about secularism through different subjects, including Vyakarana, Logic, Tantra, and Philosophy (Sing and Jha, 2017, cited in Rajeswari, 2020). Similarly, during the medieval period (10th century A.D to mid-18th century), both Muslim rulers and wealthy individuals rendered financial contributions and assistance to spread higher education in the Indian subcontinent, mainly in the areas of both humanities and science-related subjects such as mathematics, religion, accountancy, public administration, astrology, geography, history, economics, political science, astronomy, and literature (Dinesh, 2020).

However, the development of teacher training could be traced back to the early sixteenth century when missionaries started to spread western-oriented education in the Indian subcontinent. Danish missionaries established the first elementary teacher training institution in Tranquebar (now Tharangambadi) in Tamil Nadu in 1716 (Balwaria and Gupta, 2014). More than 80 years later, William Carey established the first teacher training school named Normal School in Serampur in Bengal (now in West Bengal in India) in 1802 for elementary and primary teachers (Balwaria and Gupta, 2014). Following the establishment of the Normal School, many societies attempted to set up teachers training institutions for teachers development, for instance, the Calcutta School Society in 1819, but a tacit war started between the religious missionaries and the East India Company to control the education system in the Indian subcontinent (Hossain, 2021). The East India Company emphasised establishing more teacher training institutions to train teachers so that they would be able to help native students to enter the English education

system. In 1826, Sir Thomas Munro, the Governor of Madras, in his minutes, observed that there would not be any progress in education if teachers were trained. Thomas's minutes also emphasised setting up a central school for teachers' training (Khatun and Ahmed, 2018). Following Thomas minutes, Normal Schools were set up for secondary school teachers by the Government in Madras in 1826, in Bombay in 1847, Calcutta in 1849, and in Poona, Agra, Meerut, and Banaras between 1850 and 1857 (Khatun and Ahmed, 2018).

Later on, the British rulers brought significant transformation in teacher education through the adaptation of different policies and Acts, including *Wood's Despatch* (1854), *Hunter Commission Report* (1882), *Indian Universities Act* (1902), and *Calcutta University Commission Report* (1919). For instance, Wood's Despatch emphasized the need for establishing adequate numbers of teacher training institutions across India, and consequently, Normal Schools were also opened in Dhaka (1857), Comilla (1869), and Rangpur (1882) (Hossain, 2021). Similarly, Hunter Commission included provisions for both primary and secondary school teachers. For example, it was recommended to establish Normal Schools for both public and private primary school teachers as the local requirement, and all secondary school teachers needed to pass the teaching principles and practices examinations to confirm their teaching positions (Khatun and Ahmed, 2018). The government set up a Teacher Training College in Dhaka in 1909 to offer a one-year Bachelor of Teaching and a six-months long 'Licentiate of Training' for school teachers (Government Teacher Training College of Dhaka, 2022). Following the Saddler Commission of 1917 report, education as an optional subject was introduced for a BA degree, and later, many universities set up faculties of education offering degrees in education, e.g. Department of Education at the University of Calcutta was established in 1934 (University of Calcutta, 2022). During the Pakistan period (1947-1971), six junior teachers' training colleges were set up based on the idea that the British system developed in the colonial periods.

The above discussion shows that the key focus of teacher education during the British-Indian and even in Pakistan periods was upskilling teaching-learning processes for in-service school teachers. How this teacher training program was developed could be considered merely a technical program rather than considered education as a distinctive discipline developed based on vast intellectual and theoretical orientations of the ideas of education.

'Education' as a discipline: setting up the IER at the University of Dhaka as part of the internationalisation of higher education project

When the University of Dhaka was set up in 1921, 'education' was one of the departments under the Faculty of Arts. Currently, a Faculty of Education oversees the affiliated colleges and institutes in technical teachers' training (University of Dhaka, 2022a). However, neither the department of education nor the Faculty of Education did deal with 'education' as a study area. When IER was established at the University of Dhaka in 1959, teacher education became

an area of higher study. Setting up IER at the University of Dhaka began as part of what Altbach et al. (2010) call the internationalisation of higher education. The University of Dhaka, the then Government of Pakistan, and the US Aid (then ICA mission) made a joint effort to establish an institute that would not only design the education program based on the USA model but also promote the ideological transformation of school teachers through such teacher education program (University of Dhaka, 2022b). In its early inception, the Institute adopted four key objectives, including promoting advanced research in education and offering degrees of Master of Education and PhD in education (University of Dhaka, 2022c). In this process of internationalisation of higher education, both people, programs, and services moved from the USA to the then East Pakistan (now independent Bangladesh) and vice versa (Knight, 2006; Chan and Kabir, 2014). In particular, the Colorado State University (now the University of Northern Colorado) provided technical support, including advanced overseas training for newly appointed teachers at the local institution and curriculum development. Academics from the USA universities also travelled to local institutions to lead the institutions in their early foundation stage. For instance, four USA academics played the role of Director of the IER between 1960 and 1969 (University of Dhaka, 2022c). Dr Morrison and some other US academics and staff led the institute with 33 students in its first journey in 1960 (Institute of Education and Research, 2022).

After the independence of Bangladesh in 1971, the IER at the University of Dhaka became operated under the second Statute of the University of Dhaka (University of Dhaka, 1996). Between 1971 and 1994, IER at the University of Dhaka experimented with different teacher training programs. For instance, initially, the Institute offered a two-year MEd program. Still, this two years MEd program split into two degrees – a one-year MEd and a one-year Diploma in Education – in the following decade of its establishment. Over the period, IER at DU expanded in terms of its academic programs and student and teacher numbers. In 1994, IER introduced a three-year Bachelor of Education (BEd) (honours) program aiming to establish ‘education’ as a discipline that ultimately replaced ‘education’ from a narrow connotation of teacher training in the context of Bangladesh (University of Dhaka, 2022b). The key focus of this three-year BEd program was to develop specialised educationists in four key streams – science, math and technology, language education, social science education, and special education. In 1998, three year BEd program was extended into a four-year program. Students with a four-year BEd degree from this institute pursue a one-year MEd degree in any of ten specialised education areas – pre-primary and primary education, language education, social science education, science, mathematics and technology education, educational planning and management, curriculum and educational technology, educational evaluation, and research, non-formal and continuing education, educational psychology and guidance, and special education. Apart from these regular courses, IER at the University of Dhaka also offers professional MEd, Master of Philosophy, PhD, and several short courses, including educational research and inclusive education (University of Dhaka, 2022c).

'Policy trailing' in the discipline of 'education': From Dhaka university to other public universities

More than three decades after setting up IER at the University of Dhaka, the first school of education (SOE) was set up in the Bangladesh Open University (BOU) in 1992 (Bangladesh Open University, 2022a). One of the key differences between the SOE at BOU and the school/institute/department/faculty of education at other public universities is that SOE at BOU has been using an open and distance learning mode to offer degrees in education (Bangladesh Open University, 2022b).

However, the education programs developed by IER at DU have been 'burning out' in other public universities since the early 2000s. In particular, six more public universities have been establishing departments/institutes/faculties of education offering degrees in education, modelling how IER at the University of Dhaka was developed. I analysed five threshold principles of education in these newly developed education institutions to explore how the ideas about education as a discipline were reshaped and reconstructed in other public universities by the historical and intellectual development of IER at the University of Dhaka. In particular, this analysis looked at how the IER at the University of Dhaka has been influencing the formation of these five threshold principles of education including aims and objectives, governance structure, course curriculum, and assessment approaches of these newly developed education disciplines in different public universities. The following table provides a comparative analysis between the IER at DU and these newly developed institutes in the five threshold principles of education.

Table 1: A comparative analysis of policy trailing in five threshold principles of education between IER at DU and other public universities in Bangladesh

Name of the institute/school and name of the university	Key aims and objectives, and vision and mission	Governance	Curriculum	Pedagogy	Assessment
Institute of Education and Research (IER), University of Dhaka (1959)	Four aims and objectives include promoting and providing facilities for advanced study and research in education; offering degrees in education; creating further education opportunities.	Adopted an arms-length management system where a Board of Governors (BOG) formed consisting of 13 members from different educational institutions, including within and outside the university. The BOG is headed by the Vice-Chancellor of the University of Dhaka, where the Director of IER plays the role of secretary to the BOG.	Adopted an outcome-based curriculum based on a combination of subject-matter discipline and instrumental approaches. Thus, the key characteristics of this curriculum are (1) having a collection of related topics of a particular course, (2) learning key concepts and ideas, and vocabularies through using distinct methods of inquiry related to that particular course in a specific period, and (3) to acquire work-related competencies for the job markets (Vickers, 2013).	Adopted a combination of teacher-centred and student-centred pedagogy where the lecture method is dominant in the learning activities. Other strategies include discussion, question-answer, observation, debate, seminars, and ICT integration.	Adopted grading methods and a summative assessment system comprise a heavily relied final examination system, including MCQ and essay-type questions, interviews, in-course exams and periodical assignments and students' reflective work. The key focus of this assessment is to assess the skills, competencies, and quality of educational performance of a particular course (Broadfoot, 2011).
Institute of Education and Research (IER), University of Rajshahi (2001)	Five aims and objectives include offering higher education degrees and providing other professional degrees for qualified teachers; providing higher education institutions; conducting advanced research in education (University of Rajshahi, 2001).	Adopted an arms-length management system where a Board of Governors (BOG) formed consisting of 17 members from different educational institutions, including within and outside of the university. The BOG is headed by the Vice-Chancellor of the University of Rajshahi, where the Director of IER plays the role of secretary to the BOG (University of Rajshahi, 2001).	Similar to IER at the University of Dhaka, offering regular programs of a four-year BEd (honours) and a one-year MEd, and MPhil and PhD in education. It also offers a Postgraduate Diploma in Education degree for professionals. It also adopted an outcome-based curriculum based on a combination of subject-matter discipline and instrumental approaches (University of Rajshahi, 2022a).	Similarly, it adopted a combination of teacher-centred and student-centred pedagogy, including lectures, discussion, question-answer, observation, debate, seminars, and ICT integration.	Similarly, it adopted a grading method and a summative assessment system comprising a heavily relied final examination system, in-course exams and periodical assignments.

<p>Institute of Education, Research and Training (IERT), University of Chittagong (2005)</p>	<p>Five aims and objectives include offering higher degrees in education; offering courses for study for qualified teachers; providing services for concerned higher education institutions; promoting advanced study and research across different education sectors (University of Chittagong, 2005).</p>	<p>Adopted an arms-length management system where a Governing Body (GB) was formed comprising 16 members from within and outside of CU. The GB is headed by the Vice-Chancellor of the University of Chittagong (CU). The Director of IER at the CU plays the role of secretary of GB (University of Chittagong, 2005).</p>	<p>Also, offering regular programs of a four-year BEEd (honours) and a one-year MEd and adopting an outcome-based curriculum based on a combination of subject-matter discipline and instrumental approaches.</p>	<p>A combination of teacher-centred and student-centred pedagogy is central of teaching-learning strategies.</p>	<p>Also adopted a grading system with a summative assessment comprising essay types questions, in-course exams, periodical assignments, and interview.</p>
<p>Institute of Education and Research (IER), Jagannath University (2015)</p>	<p>Five aims and objectives include promoting and providing facilities for advanced study and research, offering training and degrees in education; creating further education opportunities; providing services for higher education institutions (Jagannath University, n.d.).</p>	<p>Adopted an arms-length management system where a Board of Governors (BOG) formed consisting of 15 members from both JU and outside of the JU. The BOG is headed by the Vice-Chancellor of Jagannath University, where the Director of IER at JU plays the role of secretary to the BOG (Jagannath University, n.d.).</p>	<p>Similar to IER at the University of Dhaka, offering regular programs of a four-year BEEd (honours) and a one-year MEd. It also offers a one-year BEEd degree for professionals. It also adopted an outcome-based curriculum based on a combination of subject-matter discipline and instrumental approaches.</p>	<p>Likewise, a combination of teacher-centred and student-centred pedagogy becomes the key strategies of teaching-learning activities.</p>	<p>Adopted grading method and a summative assessment system comprising of heavily relied final examinations including short and long essay types questions, in-course exams and assignments, and interviews.</p>

<p>Institute of Education and Research (IER), Khulna University (2015)</p>	<p>The key vision includes the advancement of the education system of Bangladesh by generating highly skilled professionals in the education field. Also set up six missions, including improving teaching-learning activities of pre-service and in-service teachers; promoting technology-based teaching-learning facilities and activities; teaching and research excellence and scholarship (Khulna University, 2022a)</p>	<p>Adopted a centralised form of governance system where the VC appointed a Dean from professors on a seniority basis working under the control and supervision of the VC. IER at Khulna University as a discipline has been functioning under the School of Education (Khulna University 2022b).</p>	<p>Similarly, a combination of teacher-centred and student-centred pedagogy becomes the key strategies for teaching learning activities.</p>	<p>Adopted grading methods and a combination of formative and summative approaches heavily relied on final examinations, class tests/in courses/mid-term examinations, and presentation seminars (Khulna University, n.d.).</p>
<p>Faculty of Education Science and Technology University (2017)</p>	<p>Offering comprehensive degrees in education under departments.</p>	<p>Adopted a centralised form of governance system where the VC appointed a Dean from professors on a seniority basis working under the control and supervision of the VC (Noakhali Science and Technology University, 2001).</p>	<p>Similar to what other universities adopted, a combination of teacher-centred and student-centred pedagogy become the key methods of teaching-learning processes.</p>	<p>Also adopted a grading system with a summative assessment comprising of essay types questions, in-course exams and periodical assignments and interviews.</p>
<p></p>	<p></p>	<p>Adopting an outcome-based curriculum based on a combination of subject-matter discipline and instrumental approaches offering two different BEd (Hons.) regular programs – BEd in education and BEd in educational administration – and an MEd degree.</p>	<p>Similar to what other universities adopted, a combination of teacher-centred and student-centred pedagogy become the key methods of teaching-learning processes.</p>	<p></p>
<p></p>	<p></p>	<p></p>	<p></p>	<p></p>
<p></p>	<p></p>	<p></p>	<p></p>	<p></p>

Travelling human resources from the IER at DU to other public universities has been one of the critical strategies of policy trailing. The travelling of human resources from the centre to other public universities can be categorised into two broader types: first, the employment of graduates of IER at DU in other public universities, and second, both formal and informal involvement of academics of IER at DU in the development of different threshold principles of education in other public universities. For instance (in table 2), 67% of these five public universities' academics hold both their BEd (Hons) and MEd degrees from the IER at DU. Some of these academics also hold further higher education, e.g. MPhil and PhD from the IER at DU.

Table 2: Numbers of academics who graduated from the IER at DU in different public universities

Name of the institute/school and name of the university	No. of total academics	No. of academics graduated from IER at DU	% of total academics graduated from IER at the DU
IER, University of Rajshahi (2001)	11	6	54%
IERT, University of Chittagong (2005)	16	7	44%
IER, Jagannath University (2015)	8	7	88%
IER, the Khulna University (2015)	6	6	100%
Faculty of Education Science at the Noakhali Science and Technology University (2017)	10	8	80%
Total	51	34	67%

[Source: University of Rajshahi, 2022b; Jagannath University, 2022; University of Chittagong 2022; Khulna University, 2022c; Noakhali Science and Technology University, 2022c, 2022d]

When graduates of IER at DU are employed in other public universities, they not only travel from one institution to another physically but also travel their ideas and concepts and threshold principles about education that they learnt throughout their academic journey in their alma mater.

In addition, travelling academics from IER at DU to other public universities frequently happens through mutual academic partnerships between the IER at DU and these newly established public universities. Many academics at the IER at DU are involved in developing different principles of education in other public universities. For example, academics from IER at DU often become engaged in thesis examinations, interview boards, and questionnaire moderation and vice versa. This mutual collaboration helps to share the views about threshold principles of education between academics of IER at DU and other public universities.

Although human resources travel from IER at DU to other public universities, policy networks could also be considered a significant factor that influenced other public universities to shape and reconstruct different threshold principles of education based on the same ideas about education developed by IER at DU. For example, Noakhali Science and Technology University (NSTU), where 100% of teaching academics were the graduates from IER at DU, opened the Faculty of Education Science during the tenure of a Vice-Chancellor, who was a professor of IER at DU. The Vice-Chancellor of NSTU used his ties to influence different policy actors, including the University Grants Commission (UGC), to open the Faculty of Education Science in 2017.

Discussion and conclusion

This chapter has sought to understand how ‘education’ as a discipline has emerged through the historic development of the IER at DU through a higher education internationalisation project in 1959 and how different threshold principles of education developed by the IER at DU have been shaped and reconstructed in other public universities through the idea of ‘policy trailing’. This chapter has also shown that before the emergence of IER at DU in 1959, the key focus of the teacher training courses offered by many teachers’ training colleges was teachers’ professional development. However, establishing IER at DU through technical support from the US Aid and Colorado State University opened a new door for the academics of IER at DU to research teacher education programs from a broader perspective.

Since its inception in 1959, IER at DU has been going through different phases - the foundation phase (from 1960-1970), experimental stage (1970-1994), expanding phase (1994-2000), and ‘burnout’ phase (2000 and onward). Each of these phases is significant to developing education as a discipline in the context of Bangladesh. At the foundational phase, IER at DU developed the base of different threshold principles of education by internationalisation of higher education where both people, programs, and services moved from the USA to the IER at DU and vice-versa. In its second phase – experimental – IER academics experimented with different ideas about education in the context of Bangladesh. In the third expanding phase, the IER at DU expanded its diversified programs and offered a Bachelor of Education (honours) program. The third phase seems significant to develop ‘education’ as a higher education study area. The third phase was critical because it offered a Bachelor of Education (honours) and it helped Bangladeshi academics and policymakers see ‘education’ as a discipline from a broader perspective. In other words, the third phase took education as a mere teacher training program away and established ‘education’ as a discipline where curriculum, pedagogy, and assessment are not merely technical processes, instead, it is intellectual processes of academic activities. Finally, in the ‘burnout’ phase, IER brought different threshold principles of education to other public universities. The ‘burnout’ phase seems significant to take education as a discipline from the centre to the peripheries within a country context. In other words, it also spreads up the idea of ‘education’ as a discipline from elite to mass, where not only many public universities

offering degrees in education but also education as a distinctive discipline become what Steiner-Khamisi (2006) calls 'epidemic' and many more universities see the intellectual and educational value of education discipline and consider to offer degrees in the education discipline.

The analysis also shows that the burnout phase is closely linked with the idea of 'policy trailing'. Rather than public policymakers, a range of policy networks emerged in public universities. They broadly drew on the first two threshold principles of education – aims and objectives, vision and missions, and governance – of IER at DU in the development of education as a discipline. The rest of the three threshold principles of education – curriculum, pedagogy, and assessment – have also been trailed in other public universities from the IER at DU. Similar to what IER at DU has developed the ideas about curriculum, pedagogy, and assessment systems of education discipline, other five public universities shaped and reconstructed the same ideas about curriculum, pedagogy, and assessment systems of education. One of the key factors of policy trailing that influenced adopting similar kinds of threshold principles of education was of travelling human resources from the IER at DU to other public universities. Both IER at DU graduates who were employed in different public universities and academics contributed to the development of different threshold principles of education in other public universities.

In the policy trailing process, this paper has shown that policy networks become the key factor in shaping and reconstructing the same ideas about education across different public universities (Cort, 2014; Kabir, 2021). Both IER at DU academics and graduates used the ties with policy actors in other public universities and influenced the reconstruction process of education as a distinctive discipline. The academics of IER at DU have been working in different committees in other universities and have been using the opportunities to share their ideas about education with academics of other public universities. In other words, ideas about education as a distinctive discipline have been reconstructed in other universities through mutual relationships rather than top-down or horizontal processes (Cort, 2014).

By exploring how IER at DU emerged in 1959 and later and how different thresholds of principles of education have been shaped and reconstructed in other public universities in Bangladesh through the idea of policy trailing, this paper has also shown that first, policy formulation in higher education not only travelled from global north to global south, second but also policy formulation process has been shifted from government to governance. In particular, it has shown that the emergence of IER at DU was a part of the internationalisation of higher education projects. In this international higher education project, the then Pakistani government and international agencies, including USAID and Colorado State University, played key roles in creating IER at DU to offer degrees in teacher education and the ideological transformation of school teachers in Bangladesh. However, in post-independence Bangladesh, where the education policy-making process still seems to be top-down (Zafarullah, 2013), the ideas about education have been shaped and reconstructed through policy networks within public universities' environments. Reconstructing the same ideas about threshold principles of

education by IER at DU academics and graduates who have been employed in different public universities in other public universities exemplifies that the education policy-making process in public universities has shifted from a rigidly top-down approach to policy networks where academics of public universities develop their mutual understanding and share their views with others to shape and reconstruct ideas about threshold principles of education.

Despite academics of different public universities developing mutual understanding and sharing their views about a particular education policy-making within public universities settings, it is hard to replicate this process in the national policy-making process in Bangladesh. In particular, the government is still considered the centre of the higher education policy-making process and influences and controls the policy networks at the state-level policy formulation process in Bangladesh (Kabir, 2021).

References

- Altbach, P. G., Reisberg, L., & Rumbley, L. E. (2010). *Trends in global higher education: Tracking an academic revolution*. Rotterdam, Boston, & Taipei: Sense Publishers.
- Ball, S. J. (2008). New philanthropy, new networks and new governance in education. *Political Studies*, 56(4), 747-765. doi: 10.1111/j.1467-9248.2008.00722.x
- Balwaria, R. & Gupta, P. (2014). Historical perspective of teacher education in India. *International Educational E-Journal*, vol. III, issue: I.
- Bangladesh Open University (2022a). School of Education. Retrieved from <http://www.bouresult.info/php/schools/soe.html>
- Bangladesh Open University (2022b). About Bangladesh Open University. Retrieved from <http://www.bouresult.info/index.html>
- Broadfoot, P. (2012). *Assessment, schools and society*. London: Routledge.
- Chan, P. W. K., & Kabir, A. H. (2014). Education across borders in Hong Kong: Impacts and solution. In H. Zhang, P. W. K. Chan, and C. Boyle. (Eds.), *Equality in education: Fairness and inclusion*, pp. 155-166, Rotterdam, Boston, and Taipei: Sense Publishers
- Cort, P. (2014). Trailing the Unpredictable Pathways of European Union Lifelong Learning Policy. In M. Milana and J Holford (Eds), *Adult education policy and the European Union: Theoretical and methodological perspectives*, pp. 127-140, Rotterdam/Boston/Taipei: Sense Publishers.
- Dinesh S. (2020). Higher Education in The Medieval Period, In S. M. Babu (Ed.), *Higher Education in Indian Subcontinent: History, diversity, technology, and future*, pp. 92-108, Maharashtra: Harshwardhan Publication Pvt.Ltd.
- Government Teacher Training College of Dhaka (2022). History of teachers' training college. Retrieved from <https://ttcdhaka.edu.bd/containdtl/about-us#>

- Hossain, M. (2021). Teachers' training institute. Banglapedia. Retrieved from http://en.banglapedia.org/index.php?title=Teachers'_Training_Institute&oldid=6214
- Holford, J., & McKenzie, L. (2013). *Conceptual model and questionnaire: LLLight 'in' Europe: Lifelong learning, innovation, growth, and human capital tracks in Europe*. Unpublished Working Paper. University of Nottingham School of Education. Nottingham.
- Institute of Education and Research (2022). About the Institute of Education and Research. Retrieved from <https://ierdu.edu.bd/>
- Jagannath University (2022). Institute of Education and Research. Retrieved from <https://jnu.ac.bd/portal/getdata/5008>
- Jagannath University (n.d.). Statutes regarding the institute of education and Research (IER). Jagannath University. Jagannath University: Dhaka.
- Kabir, A, H. (2021). 'Network governance' and the formation of the strategic plan in the higher education sector in Bangladesh, *Journal of Education Policy*. 36(4), pp. 455-479. DOI: 10.1080/02680939.2020.1717637.
- Khatun, R. & Ahmed, N. (2018). Teacher education in India: a historical perspective. *International Journal of Advanced Educational Research*. Vol. 3. Issue 2.
- Khulna University (2022a). Vision and mission. Retrieved from <https://discipline.ku.ac.bd/ier/vision-mission>
- Khulna University (2022b). A brief history of IER, Khulna University. Retrieved <https://discipline.ku.ac.bd/ier/history>
- Khulna University (2022c). Institute of Education and Research: Faculties. Retrieved from <https://discipline.ku.ac.bd/ier/faculties>
- Khulna University. (n.d.). Institute of Education and Research (IER), Khulna University: Master of Education (MEd). Khulna University: Khulna.
- Knight, J. (2006). Crossborder education: An analytical framework for program and provider mobility. In J. C. Smart (Ed.), *Higher education: Handbook of theory and research*, pp. 345–395. Netherlands: Springer.
- Milana, M. (2015). Debating global polity, policy crossing, and adult education. *Comparative Education Review*, 59(3), 498-522.
- Noakhali Science and Technology University. (2001). Noakhali biggan o projukti ain 2001. Ministry of Law, Justice and Parliamentary Affairs: Dhaka.
- Noakhali Science and Technology University (2022a). Department of Education. Retrieved from <https://www.nstu.edu.bd/department/education>

- Noakhali Science and Technology University (2022b). Department of Educational Administration. Retrieved <https://www.nstu.edu.bd/departement/educational-administration>
- Noakhali Science and Technology University (2022c). Department of Education: All faculty members. Retrieved from https://www.nstu.edu.bd/departement/education/faculty_member
- Noakhali Science and Technology University (2022d). Department of Educational Administration: All faculty members. Retrieved from https://www.nstu.edu.bd/departement/educational-administration/faculty_member
- Ozga, J. (2011). Knowledge transfer and transformation: Moving knowledge from research to policy. *Perspectiva*, 29(1), 49-67. doi: 10.5007/2175-795X.2011v291p49
- Rajeswari, V. S. (2020). Higher education system of India during Buddhist period, In S. M. Babu (Ed.), *Higher Education in Indian Subcontinent: History, diversity, technology, and future*, pp. 83-91, Maharashtra: Harshwardhan Publication Pvt. Ltd.
- Steiner-Khamsi, G. (2006). The economics of policy borrowing and lending: A study of late adopters. *Oxford Review of Education*, 32(5), 665-678.
- Torres, C. A. (2009). *Education and neoliberal globalization*. New York: Routledge.
- University of Calcutta (2022). Department of Education: History. Retrieved from <https://www.caluniv.ac.in/academic/Education.html>
- University of Chittagong (2005). The Statute of the University of Chittagong: Statute regarding the Institute of Education, Research and Training (IERT). University of Chittagong: Chittagong.
- University of Chittagong (2022). Institute of Education and Research: People. Retrieved from <https://cu.ac.bd/dept/facultyprofile.php?secno=78&menumapno=130>
- University of Dhaka. (1996). The Second Statutes of the University: The Statute regarding the Institute of Education and Research. Retrieved from <https://www.du.ac.bd/download/statutes/DU-2nd-Statutes.pdf>
- University of Dhaka (2022a). Historical outline. Retrieved from <https://www.du.ac.bd/university/HistoricalOutline>
- University of Dhaka (2022b). History of the institute. Retrieved from <https://www.du.ac.bd/body/History/IER>
- University of Dhaka (2022c). Welcome to Institute of Education and Research. Retrieved from <https://du.ac.bd/webPost/98/966>
- University of Rajshahi. (2001). The institute of Education and Research: The ninth statute of the University of Rajshahi. University of Rajshahi: Rajshahi.
- University of Rajshahi (2022a). IER at a glance. Retrieved from <http://www.ru.ac.bd/ier/about/>

University of Rajshahi (2022a). Academic programs. Retrieved from <http://www.ru.ac.bd/ier/notices/class-schedule-for-bed-honours-med-mphilphd-and-pgded-and-med-january-june-2020/>

University of Rajshahi (2022b). Institute of Education & Research. Retrieved from http://103.79.117.242/ru_profile/public/teacher/404/profiles

Vickers, M. (2013). Curriculum. In C. Raewyn et al (Eds.), *Education, change and society*, pp 234-260. Oxford University Press: Oxford

Zafarullah, H. (2013). "Bureaucratic Culture and the Social-political Connection: The Bangladesh Example." *International Journal of Public Administration* 36.(13): 932–939. doi:10.1080/01900692.2013.773033.